

**IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE ELEVENTH JUDICIAL
CIRCUIT IN AND FOR MIAMI-DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA**

CASE NO: 2021-015089-CA-01

SECTION: CA43

JUDGE: Michael Hanzman

In Re: Champlain Towers South Collapse Litigation

Plaintiff(s)

vs.

N/A

Defendant(s)

OMNIBUS ORDER ON MOTIONS TO DISMISS

This cause is before the Court on:

- A. DESIMONE CONSULTING ENGINEERS LLC'S MOTION TO DISMISS COUNTS VII AND VIII OF THE CONSOLIDATED SECOND AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT WITH SUPPORTING MEMORANDUM OF LAW (D. E. 299);
- B. DEFENDANT, JOHN MORIARTY & ASSOCIATES OF FLORIDA, INC.'S MOTION TO DISMISS AND/OR STRIKE PLAINTIFFS' CONSOLIDATED SECOND AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT (D. E. 302);
- C. DEFENDANT 8701 COLLINS DEVELOPMENT, LLC'S "MOTION TO DISMISS CONSOLIDATED SECOND AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT" (D. E. 304);
- D. DEFENDANTS TG AND TWI'S MOTION TO DISMISS COUNTS I AND II OF THE CONSOLIDATED SECOND AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT (D. E. 305);
- E. NV5'S MOTION TO DISMISS PLAINTIFFS' SECOND AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, MOTION FOR A MORE DEFINITE STATEMENT (D. E. 306).

Upon review of said motions, Plaintiffs' Omnibus Response (D. E. 404), and the replies filed in support of the motions, it is hereby **ORDERED**:

Each of the Motions to Dismiss are **DENIED**. Defendants shall file their answers to Plaintiffs' Consolidated Second Amended Class Action Complaint within twenty (20) days of this Order.

DONE and ORDERED in Chambers at Miami-Dade County, Florida on this 3rd day of February, 2022.



2021-015089-CA-01 02-03-2022 10:11 PM

2021-015089-CA-01 02-03-2022 10:11 PM

Hon. Michael Hanzman

CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE

Electronically Signed

No Further Judicial Action Required on **THIS MOTION**

CLERK TO **RECLOSE** CASE IF POST JUDGMENT

Electronically Served:

Aaron Podhurst, apodhurst@podhurst.com
Aaron Podhurst, dricker@podhurst.com
Adam A Schwartzbaum, adams@moskowitz-law.com
Adam A Schwartzbaum, service@moskowitz-law.com
Adam A Schwartzbaum, dione@moskowitz-law.com
Adam Moskowitz, adam@moskowitz-law.com
Adam Moskowitz, dione@moskowitz-law.com
Adam Moskowitz, service@moskowitz-law.com
Alfred Armas, alfred@armaslaw.com
Alison E Patino, apatino@patinolaw.com
Amanda Anderson, AAnderson@insurance-counsel.com
Amanda K Anderson, eservice@insurance-counsel.com
Amanda K Anderson, aanderson@insurance-counsel.com
Amanda K Anderson, InsuranceCounsel2050@gmail.com
Ana Angelica Viciano, anita@miamidade.gov
Ana Angelica Viciano, mbarber@miamidade.gov
Andrew B. Yaffa, aby@grossmanroth.com
Andrew B. Yaffa, omb@grossmanroth.com
Andrew M Feldman, feldmana@kleinpark.com
Andrew M Feldman, montanem@kleinpark.com

Andrew M Feldman, piersonj@kleinpark.com
Andrew P. Gold, Esq., andrew.gold@akerman.com
Andrew P. Gold, Esq., jill.parnes@akerman.com
Andrew Paul Gold, andrew.gold@akerman.com
Andrew Paul Gold, jill.parnes@akerman.com
Andrew Paul Gold, bobbi.engelke@akerman.com
Andrew Russell Kruppa, andrew.kruppa@squirepb.com
Andrew Russell Kruppa, patricia.sullivan@squirepb.com
Andrew Russell Kruppa, FLA_Dckt@squirepb.com
Anthony J Carriuolo, acarriuolo@bergersingerman.com
Anthony J Carriuolo, mnewland@bergersingerman.com
Anthony J Carriuolo, drt@bergersingerman.com
Anthony Perez, aperez@hsmmpa.com
Aron Raskas, araskas@gunster.com
Aron Raskas, avalido@gunster.com
Aron Raskas, eservice@gunster.com
Benjamin Fernandez IV, bfernandez@silvasilva.com
Benjamin Fernandez IV, cvereen@silvasilva.com
Benjamin Fernandez, IV, bfernandez@silvasilva.com
Benjamin Fernandez, IV, tgomez@silvasilva.com
Bernadette Vazquez, bvazquez@klugerkaplan.com
Bernadette Vazquez, clong@klugerkaplan.com
Bradford R. Sohn, brad@bradsohnlaw.com
Bradford R. Sohn, paralegal@bradsohnlaw.com
Bradford R. Sohn, service.bradsohnlaw@gmail.com
Bradley J Edwards, staff.efile@epllc.com
Bradley J Edwards, brad@epllc.com
Bradley J Edwards, maria@epllc.com
Brenda Radmacher, brenda.radmacher@akerman.com
Bret M Feldman, feldmanb@phelps.com
Bret M Feldman, yolanda.vazquez@phelps.com
Brian S Dervishi, bdervishi@wdpalaw.com
Brian S Dervishi, service@wdpalaw.com
Bruce Alan Katzen, bkatzen@klugerkaplan.com
Bruce Alan Katzen, cfalla@klugerkaplan.com
Bruce Alan Katzen, probate@klugerkaplan.com
Carlos A. Velasquez, CVelasquez@VDLawyers.com
Carlos A. Velasquez, Andrea@VDLawyers.com

Carlos E Silva, csilva@silvasilva.com
Carlos E Silva, mromera@silvasilva.com
Carlos M. Macias, macias@leesfield.com
Carlos M. Macias, becerra@leesfield.com
Carlos M. Macias, abreu@leesfield.com
Caroline Catchpole Spradlin, caroline.spradlin@phelps.com
Caroline Catchpole Spradlin, samantha.powell@phelps.com
Carolyn M. Luna, cluna@patinolaw.com
Christine L. Welstead, christine.welstead@bowmanandbrooke.com
Christine L. Welstead, ashleigh.carroll@bowmanandbrooke.com
Christine L. Welstead, lisa.morales@bowmanandbrooke.com
Christopher L Barnett, barnettch@gtlaw.com
Christopher L Barnett, nicauda@gtlaw.com
Christopher S Carver, christopher.carver@akerman.com
Christopher S Carver, cary.gonzalez@akerman.com
Cole Scott &Kissane PA, Ryan.Charlson@csklegal.com
Cole Scott &Kissane PA, Ryan.Sooahoo@csklegal.com
Cole Scott &Kissane PA, Construction.FTLW@csklegal.com
Cosme Caballero, ccaballero@deutschblumberg.com
Cosme Caballero, kdominguez@deutschblumberg.com
Cosme Caballero, rvargas@deutschblumberg.com
Cosme Caballero, Esq., ccaballero@deutschblumberg.com
Cosme Caballero, Esq., bblumberg@deutschblumberg.com
Curtis Miner, curt@colson.com
Curtis Miner, claudiav@colson.com
Curtis Miner, eservice@colson.com
Daniel Y Gielchinsky, dan@dgmilaw.com
Daniel Y Gielchinsky, tatiana@dgmilaw.com
David B. Weinstein, weinsteind@gtlaw.com
David B. Weinstein, thomasm@gtlaw.com
David L Rosinsky Esq., LUKSFLL-Pleadings@LS-LAW.COM
David L Rosinsky Esq., Drosinsky@insurancedefense.net
David L Rosinsky Esq., drosenbaum@insurancedefense.net
David M Wells, dwells@gunster.com
David M Wells, dculmer@gunster.com
David M. Murray, dmmurray@miami-airport.com
David M. Murray, dmmurray@miami-airport.com
David M. Murray, rmartin@miami-airport.com

David M. Wells, dwells@gunster.com
David M. Wells, dculmer@gunster.com
David M. Wells, eservice@gunster.com
David Stanoch, david@honiklaw.com
Dorian N. Daggs, ddaggs@hsmpa.com
Douglas J. Kress, dkress@schwedpa.com
Douglas J. Kress, lrandell@schwedpa.com
Douglas J. Kress, amarcus@schwedpa.com
Dustin C. Blumenthal, dblumenthal@goldbergsegalla.com
Dustin C. Blumenthal, ppowers@goldbergsegalla.com
E. Bruce Johnson, johnson@jambg.com
E. Bruce Johnson, young@jambg.com
Edward Marod, emarod@gunster.com
Edward Marod, dpeterson@gunster.com
Edward R. Blumberg, erb@deutschblumberg.com
Edward R. Blumberg, rmitchell@deutschblumberg.com
Edward R. Blumberg, kdominguez@deutschblumberg.com
Elliot H. Scherker, scherkere@gtlaw.com
Elliot H. Scherker, miamiappellateservice@gtlaw.com
Eric P. Hockman, ehockman@wsh-law.com
Eric P. Hockman, lmartinez@wsh-law.com
Eric Page Hockman, ehockman@wsh-law.com
Eric Page Hockman, lmartinez@wsh-law.com
Eric S Kay, ekay@kttlaw.com
Eric S Kay, ga@kttlaw.com
Eric S Kay, agarcia@kttlaw.com
Felipe Gonzalez, fgonzalez@switkeslaw.com
Felipe Gonzalez, paralegal@switkeslaw.com
Felipe Gonzalez, paralegal@switkeslaw.com
Frank Florio, FFlorio@gunster.com
George R Truitt Jr., george.truitt@csklegal.com
George R Truitt Jr., construction.miami@csklegal.com
Gonzalo Barr, gbarr@dldlawyers.com
Gonzalo Barr, viviane@dldlawyers.com
Gonzalo Dorta, grd@dortalaw.com
Gonzalo R Dorta, grd@dortalaw.com
Gonzalo R Dorta, jpedraza@dortalaw.com
Gonzalo R Dorta, jgonzalez@dortalaw.com

Graham LippSmith, g@lippsmith.com
Graham LippSmith, mb@lippsmith.com
Graham LippSmith, cca@lippsmith.com
H. Clay Roberts, gloria@robertspa.com
H. Clay Roberts, roberts@robertspa.com
H. Clay Roberts, jennifer@robertspa.com
Hali E Marsocci, Hali@RomanoLawGroup.com
Hali E Marsocci, Becky@RomanoLawGroup.com
Hali E Marsocci, Service@RomanoLawGroup.com
Harley S. Tropin Esq., hst@kttl.com
Harley S. Tropin Esq., sf@kttl.com
Harley Tropin, hst@kttl.com
Henry Lawrence Perry, lperry@perry-young.com
Henry Lawrence Perry, kroberson@perry-young.com
Henry Lawrence Perry, frichard@perry-young.com
Henry N. Wixon, henry.wixon@nist.gov
Houston S. Park III, parkh@kleinpark.com
Houston S. Park III, harriss@kleinpark.com
Howard Kraft Pita, spita@pwndlawfirm.com
Howard Kraft Pita, lalvarez@pwndlawfirm.com
Howard Kraft Pita, pitaservice@pwndlawfirm.com
Howard M Bushman, howard@moskowitz-law.com
Howard M Bushman, dione@moskowitz-law.com
JOHN H RUIZ, jruiz@msprecoverylawfirm.com
JOHN H RUIZ, serve@msprecoverylawfirm.com
JOHN H RUIZ, jruiz@msprecovery.com
Janel C. Diamond, jdiamond@gunster.com
Javier A. Lopez Esq., jal@kttl.com
Javier A. Lopez Esq., ya@kttl.com
Javier A. Lopez Esq., fsr@kttl.com
Javier Zapata, jzapata@miamidade.gov
Jeffrey Lee Newsome II, jeffrey.newsome@phelps.com
Jeffrey Lee Newsome II, samantha.powell@phelps.com
Jeffrey Michael Cohen, jmcohen@cfjblaw.com
Jeffrey Michael Cohen, schacon@carltonfields.com
Jeffrey Michael Cohen, miaecf@cfdom.net
Jillian M Askren, askrenj@gtlaw.com
Jillian M Askren, thomasm@gtlaw.com

Joel L McNabney, joel.mcnabney@clydeco.us
Joel L McNabney, Audrie.Finney@clydeco.us
Joel L McNabney, miainsfilings@clydeco.us
John B. Morgan, jmorgan@forthepeople.com
John B. Morgan, kmitnik@forthepeople.com
John B. Morgan, andrew@forthepeople.com
John Davis, jdavis@slackdavis.com
John H. Ruiz, jruiz@msprecoverylawfirm.com
John H. Ruiz, serve@msprecoverylawfirm.com
John H. Ruiz, afernandez@msprecoverylawfirm.com
John Romano, John@RomanoLawGroup.com
John Scarola, _scarolteam@searcylaw.com
John Scarola, mmccann@searcylaw.com
John Scarola, _scarolteam@searcylaw.com
Jonathan E Kanov, jekanov@mdwcg.com
Jonathan E Kanov, kafriday@mdwcg.com
Jordi Guso, jguso@bergersingerman.com
Jordi Guso, drt@bergersingerman.com
Jordi Guso, fsellers@bergersingerman.com
Jorge A Calil Esq., jorge@jcalillaw.com
Jorge A Calil Esq., jeannie.calillaw@gmail.com
Jorge L. Piedra, jpiedra@kttlaw.com
Jorge L. Piedra, ga@kttlaw.com
Jorge Silva, jsilva@silvasilva.com
Jorge Silva, csilva@silvasilva.com
Jorge Silva, hsoto@silvasilva.com
Joseph H. Serota, jserota@wsh-law.com
Joseph H. Serota, lmartinez@wsh-law.com
Joseph M. Kaye, joseph@moskowitz-law.com
Joseph M. Kaye, dione@moskowitz-law.com
Josh M Rubens, jrubens@klugerkaplan.com
Josh M Rubens, cfalla@klugerkaplan.com
Josh M Rubens, cfernandez@klugerkaplan.com
Joshua Talcovitz, TalcovitzJ@kleinpark.com
Jourdan Leslie Weltman, jw0326@universalproperty.com
Jourdan Leslie Weltman, subrogationservice@universalproperty.com
Jourdan Leslie Weltman, vm1217@universalproperty.com
Judd G. Rosen, pleadings@goldbergandrosen.com

Judd G. Rosen, jgrsecy@goldbergrandrosen.com
Julia Holden-Davis, JHoldenDavis@gunster.com
Julia Holden-Davis, dholland@gunster.com
Julian S. Geraci Esq., jgeraci@pbcgov.org
Julian S. Geraci Esq., aairey@pbcgov.org
Karen B Parker, kparker@kbparkerlaw.com
Karen B Parker, fmartinez@kbparkerlaw.com
Karen B Parker, ebacker@kbparkerlaw.com
Kenneth R Drake, kendrake@dldlawyers.com
Kenneth R Drake, viviane@dldlawyers.com
Kerry L. Burns, kburns@bergersingerman.com
Kerry L. Burns, efile@bergersingerman.com
Laritza Orozco, Orozcol@kleinpark.com
Laura Adams, lauraadams@miamisao.com
Lauren E. Morse, laurenm@miamidade.gov
Lauren E. Morse, olgal@miamidade.gov
Lauren E. Morse, hern@miamidade.gov
Lauren Morse, lauren.morse@miamidade.gov
Lewis N Jack Jr., LNJ@florida-attorneys.com
Lewis N Jack Jr., cmf@florida-attorneys.com
Luis Eduardo Suarez, lsuarez@hsmpa.com
Luis Eduardo Suarez, filings@hsmpa.com
Manual Arteaga-Gomez, aag@grossmanroth.com
Marc J. Gottlieb, marc.gottlieb@akerman.com
Marc J. Gottlieb, joyce.gutierrez@akerman.com
Marc J. Gottlieb, Esq., marc.gottlieb@akerman.com
Marc J. Gottlieb, Esq., joyce.gutierrez@akerman.com
Maria Corghi, mcorghi@silvasilva.com
Maria Corghi, mcorghi@silvasilva.com
Mark A Boyle, Eservice@Insurance-Counsel.com
Mark A Boyle, MBoyle@Insurance-Counsel.com
Mark A Boyle, InsuranceCounsel2050@gmail.com
Mark J. Heise, mheise@hsmpa.com
Mark J. Sullivan, sullivanm@kleinpark.com
Mark J. Sullivan, piersonj@kleinpark.com
Mark J. Sullivan, montanem@kleinpark.com
Mark R. Antonelli, mantonelli@gaebemullen.com
Mark R. Antonelli, cgreer@gaebemullen.com

Mark R. Antonelli, lbeggs@gaebemullen.com
Matthew Wildner, mjwildner@mdwgcg.com
Matthew Wildner, kafriday@mdwgcg.com
Meghan C Moore Moore, meghan.moore@flastergreenberg.com
Meghan C Moore Moore, betty.plasencia@flastergreenberg.com
Michael Caballero, mcaballero@hsmpa.com
Michael F. Suarez, MFS-KD@kubickidraper.com
Michael F. Suarez, mfs@kubickidraper.com
Michael I. Goldberg, michael.goldberg@akerman.com
Michael I. Goldberg, charlene.cerda@akerman.com
Michael I. Goldberg, kimberly.smiley@akerman.com
Michael J Thomas, thomasmic@gtlaw.com
Michael J Thomas, cordovam@gtlaw.com
Michael J Thomas, flservice@gtlaw.com
Michael S Hooker, michael.hooker@phelps.com
Michael S Hooker, guy.mcconnell@phelps.com
Michael S Hooker, renee.hogue@phelps.com
Mitchel Chusid, mchusid@ritterchusid.com
Mitchel Chusid, karenz@ritterchusid.com
Mitchel Chusid, ifeliciano@ritterchusid.com
Mustafa Hasan Dandashly, pleadings@goldbergandrosen.com
Mustafa Hasan Dandashly, mdandashly@goldbergandrosen.com
Mustafa Hasan Dandashly, evelyn@goldbergandrosen.com
Nicole Juarez, njuarez@hsmpa.com
Oscar E. Marrero, oem@marrerolegal.com
Patricia Melville, pmelville@hsmpa.com
Paul A. Avron, pavron@bergersingerman.com
Paul J. Schwiep, pschwiep@coffeyburlington.com
Paul J. Schwiep, yvb@coffeyburlington.com
Paul J. Schwiep, service@coffeyburlington.com
Paul Jon Layne, playne@silvasilva.com
Paul Jon Layne, mromera@silvasilva.com
Paul Jon Layne, vramos@silvasilva.com
Paul S Singerman, singerman@bergersingerman.com
Paul S Singerman, mdiaz@bergersingerman.com
Paul S Singerman, efile@bergersingerman.com
Paul Steven Labiner, Pleadings@PIALawCenter.com
Rachel W. Furst, rwf@grossmanroth.com

Rachel Wagner Furst, rwf@grossmanroth.com
Ralph George Patino, service@patinolaw.com
Ralph George Patino, rpatino@patinolaw.com
Ralph George Patino, cluna@patinolaw.com
Rami Shmuely, rshmuely@cmslawgroup.com
Randy M Weber, rmweber@pwndlawfirm.com
Randy M Weber, ngarcia@pwndlawfirm.com
Ricardo Manoel Martinez-Cid, rmcid@podhurst.com
Ricardo Manoel Martinez-Cid, RMCTeam@podhurst.com
Ricardo Manoel Martinez-Cid, lbarrington@podhurst.com
Robert J. Mongeluzzi, rmongeluzzi@smbb.com
Robert J. Mongeluzzi, jgoodman@smbb.com
Robert J. Mongeluzzi, sdordick@smbb.com
Robert L Switkes, Rswitkes@switkeslaw.com
Robert L Switkes, paralegal@switkeslaw.com
Robert L Switkes, bzappala@switkeslaw.com
Robert M Klein, kleinr@kleinpark.com
Robert M Klein, piersonj@kleinpark.com
Robert M Klein, carrillom@kleinpark.com
Rosalyn Lax, rlax@hsmmpa.com
Ruben Honik, ruben@honiklaw.com
Ryan A Waton, rwaton@zdlaw.com
Ryan J. Yaffa, rjy@grossmanroth.com
Ryan M. Charlson, ryan.charlson@csklegal.com
Ryan M. Charlson, nicole.kaufman@csklegal.com
Ryan Thomas Hopper, hopperr@gtlaw.com
Ryan Thomas Hopper, ryan.t.hopper@gmail.com
Ryan Thomas Hopper, thomasm@gtlaw.com
STEVEN JEFFREY BRODIE, sbrodie@carltonfields.com
STEVEN JEFFREY BRODIE, ldelpino@carltonfields.com
Scott Andrew Hiaasen, shiaasen@coffeyburlington.com
Scott Andrew Hiaasen, lperez@coffeyburlington.com
Scott Andrew Hiaasen, service@coffeyburlington.com
Sergio L Mendez, sergio@mendezandmendezlaw.com
Sergio L Mendez, service@mendezandmendezlaw.com
Sergio L Mendez, lorena@mendezandmendezlaw.com
Seth M Lehrman, staff.efile@epllc.com
Seth M Lehrman, seth@epllc.com

Seth M Lehrman, iris@epllc.com
Seth M Schimmel, seth.schimmel@phelps.com
Seth M Schimmel, yolanda.vazquez@phelps.com
Seth M Schimmel, nicole.marsade@phelps.com
Shannon Lyn Nunez del Prado, sdelprado@pwndlawfirm.com
Stuart Z Grossman, szg@grossmanroth.com
Stuart Z Grossman, lka@grossmanroth.com
Tal J Lifshitz, tj1@kttlaw.com
Tal J Lifshitz, ya@kttlaw.com
Tal J Lifshitz, fsr@kttlaw.com
Tal J. Lifshitz, tj1@kttlaw.com
Tal J. Lifshitz, ya@kttlaw.com
Thomas A. Robes, Trobes@robeslawgroup.com
Thomas A. Robes, jbuchko@robeslawgroup.com
Thomas A. Robes, dmarie@robeslawgroup.com
Todd Romano, Todd@RomanolawGroup.com
Valerie Shea, vshea@goldbergsegalla.com
Wanda Monteverde, monteverdew@kleinpark.com
William F. Merlin Jr, cmerlin@merlinlawgroup.com
William F. Merlin Jr, ssmith@merlinlawgroup.com
William F. Merlin Jr, trodriguez@merlinlawgroup.com
William J Tinsley Jr., william.tinsley@phelps.com
William J Tinsley Jr., yolanda.vazquez@phelps.com
William P. Mulligan, wpm@grossmanroth.com
William P. Mulligan, lka@grossmanroth.com
Yechezkel Rodal, chezky@forthepeople.com
Yechezkel Rodal, rmongeluzzi@smbb.com
Yechezkel Rodal, jgoodman@smbb.com
Yechezkel Rodal, chezky@forthepeople.com
Yitzhak Levin, ylevin@levinlitigation.com
Yitzhak Levin, service@levinlitigation.com
Yummy Marrero, Ymarrero@gaebemullen.com

Physically Served: